

From the Desk of Mufti Afzal Hoosen Elias
(May Allaah protect him)

P.O.Box 1088
Ridgeway
2099

Fax: (+27) 011 680 1639
E-mail: muftie@alislam.co.za
Website: www.alislam.co.za

السلام عليكم ورحمة الله وبركاته

Advice to Khanqah Brothers

All praise is due only to Allaah. We laud Him and beseech His aid and beg forgiveness only from Him and believe in Him and rely solely on Him. We seek salvation in Him from the evils of our inner selves and the vices of our actions. There is none to misguide one whom Allaah intends to guide. I bear witness that there is no one worthy of worship but Allaah, the One who has no partner. I also testify that Hadhrat Muhammad ﷺ is the faithful servant and the Last Rasul of Allaah. May Allaah Ta'ala's mercy be on him, his family and his Sahabaah ؓ and may He bless them and raise their status.

A few points to ponder over:-

- 1.) Most authors who try to prove the validity of "congregational loud zikr in unison in the Masjid" totally miss the point and mislead the simple masses.
- 2.) They labouriously dwell on the virtues, status and importance of zikr whereas that is not the bone of contention.
- 3.) They lead academic discussions trying to forcefully prove that loud zikr is better than soft zikr, again this is not the issue on hand.
- 4.) Aayats and Ahadeeth are given wrong interpretations.
- 5.) The statements of 'recent' scholars are given preference over 'later' scholars.
- 6.) The practices of the Khanqah are superseded over the Shariah.
- 7.) The views of the Sufiya are given superiority over the Fuqaha.
- 8.) There is not a single event wherein Sahaabah gathered for collective loud zikr.
- 9.) The zikr method of Sahaabah are criterion not Sufiya who came centuries later.
- 10.) The Ibaadat practices of Sahaabah are criterion not that of mountains and birds.
- 11.) Proofs cannot be forcefully extracted from general meaning and text having unrelated scope in the Quraan and Ahaadith.
- 12.) The 'tasbih' of Hadhrat Yunus (alayhis salaam) was a dua and he was 'alone'. How can collective zikr be proven from within the fish.

- 13.) It is not proven anywhere that Hadhrat Musa (alayhis salaam) would sit in a halqah in an area and engage in loud collective zikr.
- 14.) No one has the right to impose on others ones personal understanding and interpretation, giving it the status of Ibaadat or Wujoob. Can you imagine what will then be the shape of Shariat.
- 15.) There are no explicit proofs to substantiate collective loud zikr.
- 16.) Exceptions are not principles. Primary principles are bases for law formulations not exception.
- 17.) There is Ijma (consensus) of the Ulema that silent zikr is better and loud zikr is bid'at except in special cases – Tafseer Mazhari. Now there is a trust to prove the opposite.**
- 18.) Loud zikr is makrooh. Silent verbal zikr is highly meritorious. Zikr from the inner heart is the highest form.
- 19.) Any statement which goes against the Nusoos or Sunnat will be discarded or suitably interpreted to reconcile with the mainstream ijma.
- 20.) In it (Shari practices such as Athaan), jahr is established in terms of Shari daleel. However, in acts which are not established in the Shariah, Khafi (silent zikr) is best.
- 21.) The original rule cannot be superseded by the exceptions which are in conflict with the original rule.
- 22.) Zikr is not the aim, Islaah is, zikr aids Islaah.
- 23.) A mubah (permissible act) which the masses believe to be Sunnah is bidat.
- 24.) Authenticity of Hadith also depend upon acceptance by the Fuqaha of the Ummah.
- 25.) Ibn Bitaal and others have said that the authorities of the Mathhabs are unanimous in the ruling that raising the voice in zikr is not Mustahab. Imaam Shaafi (A.R) has explained that 'jahr' was made for a short while, not permanently – Rasaail.
- 26.) Reciting it (Durood Shareef) on Friday is specifically emphasised. But, to recite it 'jahraan' in Ijtimaai form (loud collective form) is not substantiated by the Hadith and Fiqh – (Mufti Mehmood ul Hassan (A.R)).
- 27.) Assistance on Mandoob drives it to the confines of Karaahat (ibid).
- 28.) Shaikh Yusuf bin Ismaeel An Nibaani says in his Hujjatullaah Alal Aalameen: "Whoever says that Sunnat is only what is explicitly mentioned in the Ahaadith, has in fact rejected all the Mathhabs of the Mujtahideen. He has rejected Ijma. The evil of this belief is not hidden. We seek protection from Allaah Taala (against such deviation)."
- 29.) The 'amal' of the Fuqaha e Mutaqaddimeen override the Hadith classifications of the Muhadditheen.

- 30.) A hadith which is in circulation among the Fuqaha is better than a Hadith in circulation among the Shuyookh of Hadith – Wakee bin Jarrah.
- 31.) Shariat revolves around the permanent practice from the time of Sahabaah (R.A).
- 32.) There is no Hadith which explicitly states the superiority of loud zikr.
- 33.) Hence, it is incumbent for the masses not to follow the Sufiyah in Uloom. On the contrary, they should follow the Jamhoor Ulama because they (the Ulema) are the supervisors and administrators of the Shariat – Moulana Thanvi (A.R).
- 34.) The expulsion of those innovators who were engaged in collective loud zikr in the Masjid is found in “Musannaf Abdur Razzaq” and “Fataawa Bazzaziyah.”
- 35.) “It is Mustahab to recite Takbeer along the route to the Eidgah, but not collectively in unison. Since it is not the established method of reciting it, the Fuqaha said it is not permissible.” Fatawa Rahimiyyah.
- 36.) Preference of the words of Nabi (S.A.W) is given over actions.
- 37.) It is possible for a permissible act to become impermissible because of some accretion.
- 38.) The views of the Sahabah (R.A) are based on valid Shari proofs, not products of free imagination.
- 39.) A mubah (permissible) act, in fact a Mandoob (Mustahab/ Sunnat) act becomes Bidah and unlawful because of iltizaam (making it necessary), hence even the Ta’amul (regular practice of the Mutaqaddimeen (An Mubab/ Mandoob) act is not hujjat (proof). Allaamah Khalil Ahmed (A.R) in Baraahim Qaatiah.
- 40.) A Muqallid Mufti cannot present a Hadith to support his personal view which conflicts with the Mathhab he follows.
- 41.) There is no precedent for this type of public collective ibaadat in the Khairul Quroon (Best of eras).
- 42.) The Sufi Tariqahs are not proofs in Shariah.
- 43.) Preventing the perpetration of Haraam and Bidah in the Masjid can never be equalled to preventing people from Zikr in the Masjid.
- 44.) Allamah Suyutis or any other great scholars views will be discarded when it comes in conflict with the Aimmaah e Mujtahideen.
- 45.) There are no cases of collective loud zikr gatherings mentioned explicitly in the Ahadith. From certain Ahadith inferences have been drawn. But inference does not create certitude.
- 46.) When a practice wavers between Sunnah and Bidah, the Sunnah will be discarded – Principle of Imaam Abu Hanifah (A.R).
- 47.) Discard the doubtful.

48.) Shariat is complete, do not add.

49.) Shariat is simple, the ways to gain proximity to Allaah are stipulated, do not deviate.

50.) Are you saying Hadhrat is doing an act of Bid'at. Answer. Yes. Shariat is Shariat. Look at that and not at Hadhrat's face in order to make a proper valid non-emotional decision.

Read, understand, study the above clauses, you will be saved from many innovations.

May Allaah Jalla Majdahu grant guidance to all.

A. H. Elias (Mufti)

May Allaah Taala be with him.

1430/ 2009